

**BUREAU FOR INTERNATIONAL LANGUAGE CO-ORDINATION
BUREAU DE COORDINATION LINGUISTIQUE INTERNATIONALE**



**ISTANBUL, TURKEY
Minutes of the Steering Committee
24-27 May 2010**

IN ATTENDANCE

Belgium	Dr. Marc Isselé
Bulgaria	Mrs. Emilija Nesheva
Canada	Lt. Col. Danny Houde
Czech Republic	Col. Ladislav Chaloupsky
Denmark	Lt Col. Steen Bornholdt Andersen
Estonia	Mrs. Epp Leete
France	Maj. Bertrand Ramon
Germany	Dr. Christopher Hüllen
Hungary	Maj. Anikò Safar Gyuriczane
Italy	BGen Gianfranco di Luzio
Lithuania	Ms. Irena Katauskiene
Netherlands	Mr. Gerard Seinhorst
Norway	Mr. Ola Johan Berntsen
Poland	Mr. Aleksandar Skrzypek
Portugal	Lt (N) , Marta da Conceição dos Santos Gabriel
Romania	Col Florian Pirnoiu
Slovenia	Ms. Dubravka Zupanec
Spain	Lt. Col. José M. Lamela Herrera
Turkey	Lt. Col. Resul Baltaci
United Kingdom	Mr. Jerry Nowers
United States	Col. Howard G. Jones

OBSERVERS

Australia	Mrs. Anna Ivanova
Austria	BGen. Horst Walther
Bosnia and Herzegovina	Maj. Edin Bajramovic
Finland	Ms. Paivi Kilpinen
Serbia	Lt. Col Zikica Milinkovic
Sweden	Ms. Catrine Modig
NATO HQ (IMS)	Mr. Philip Turner
NATO SHAPE	Mr Mike Adubato
NATO HQ (IS)	Mr Bruce Bach

**BUREAU FOR INTERNATIONAL LANGUAGE CO-ORDINATION
BUREAU DE COORDINATION LINGUISTIQUE INTERNATIONALE**

BILC SECRETARIAT

Chair	Dr. Richard D. Monaghan
Secretary	Ms. Julie Dubeau
Deputy Secretary	Ms. Jana Vasilj-Begovic
Associate Secretary	Ms. Peggy Garza
Associate Secretary	Mr. Keith Wert

Monday, May 24, 2010

Item 1: Overture

a. Introductions and Recognition of the New Heads of Delegations

Introductions are made and the Chairman (CM) welcomes the new heads of delegations.

b. Approval of the final Minutes from the Rome Conference

CM asks for amendments to the minutes from Rome. None offered. Canada moves the minutes be approved. Germany seconds the motion. Motion approved.

c. Approval of Agenda

CM asks for amendments to the agenda. The UK moves the agenda be adopted. The US seconds the motion. Motion approved.

Item 2: Information

The Secretary gives an overview of some info items that will be discussed in more detail during the plenary. She takes the opportunity to acknowledge the Copenhagen Seminar as a huge success.

NTG Re-structuring

- ◆ CM briefs the SC on the reorganization process NATO and ACT/NTG are undergoing.

ETS Calibration Project

- ◆ The Secretary noted that several people who participate in BILC attended an ETS TOEIC/STANAG calibration project in Paris in March 2010. Participants with STANAG 6001 expertise concluded that the two systems are incompatible.

**BUREAU FOR INTERNATIONAL LANGUAGE CO-ORDINATION
BUREAU DE COORDINATION LINGUISTIQUE INTERNATIONALE**

Subsidies for Partners – Status

- ◆ The Secretary states that for the past few months, there have been conflicting reports regarding the availability of subsidies for partner nations and that this issue is still unresolved. She recommends that nations continue applying for subsidies.

Structure/Timings of Steering Committee Meetings

- ◆ CM explains that there is a bit of a glitch in procedure. Once the conference is finished and the Study Group recommendations have been submitted, it is too late for the Steering Committee (SC) to approve recommendations be brought to the JSSG. The Dutch delegate recommended that the scheduling of the SC meeting be modified so that study group reports could be considered by the SC before returning to the plenary.

Item 3: Action Items from Last Conference.

- a. Complete the development of the BILC Benchmark Advisory Test (BAT) and begin test administrations to assist nations with standardising their national STANAG 6001 tests against the benchmark.
 - ◆ **STATUS:** This task was accomplished: Benchmarking using the BAT ‘allocations’ concluded in December 2009. A complete report was sent in January 2010 to BILC SC members as well as to ACT/NTG/JSSG. JSSG received a report in the fall 2009 and in spring of 2010. A copy of the report may be obtained from the Secretary.
- b. ACO/ACT “Taskings” – Conduct a preliminary language Analysis of NATO CE posts.
 - **STATUS:** This task was accomplished: A sample of CE Job Descriptions drawn from the ISAF mission was examined to see if the tasks matched the required level of proficiency. A report was sent February 2010 to BILC SC members as well as to ACT/NTG/JSSG. A copy of the report may be obtained from the Secretary.

Tuesday, May 25, 2010

Item 4: New Action Items: 2010 ACT Taskings, IMS Report on the Action plan for Enhancing Interoperability, ACT/NTG/JSSG Priorities for BILC

- a. BAT Testing Beyond the ACT-sponsored allocations. Discussion

(IAW IMS Report Dated 3 Nov 09, BILC is to make recommendation to ACT who will advise IMS re Expansion of BAT funding, NLT October 2010.)
 - ◆ The Secretaries explain the results of the BAT and what the nations obtained from this information. The results confirmed to some nations that they were on the right track, and to others that their testing systems needed changing. CM asks for an indication from the countries that used the BAT if they found it relevant and valuable. The Belgian and the

BUREAU FOR INTERNATIONAL LANGUAGE CO-ORDINATION
BUREAU DE COORDINATION LINGUISTIQUE INTERNATIONALE

Czech Republic delegates among others found it relevant and interesting as it showed these nations where they stood in this respect.

- ◆ CM points out that the time has come to decide what level of support to provide for the continuation of the BAT development. The Secretary mentions that funds may be required for further BAT development, if the volume of administrations is large enough. CM asks whether there are any nations planning to use the BAT in 2010. Nations respond by saying that financial support from their respective authorities would be needed. In light of financial constraints nations cannot commit themselves at this time. CM requested an indication from nations of the intention to use of the BAT over the next three years.
- ◆ Based on the responses, CM observed that over the next three years six nations plan to use the BAT. The Danish delegate states that even though Denmark would not be using the BAT it is willing to participate in further development.

b. NTG w/ BILC is tasked to instigate an LNA of SLP levels in NATO Job Descriptions.

IAW JSSG Spring meeting March 2010, BILC is to make recommendations to ACT who will advise IMS on feasibility and parameters of analysis, after this conference. Tasking to be completed NLT June 2011.

- ◆ The Secretary provides background information on this tasking and states that it refers to the reporting on feasibility of such an analysis. During this conference, a study group will scrutinize this tasking and propose recommendations. Conducting a full study would be a significant challenge, as JSSG and ACT are well aware. CM adds that the SC could make recommendations, based on the relevant study group report, as to how this review could be done. A BILC working group, for example, could recommend a protocol to aid in the process.

Wednesday, May 26, 2010

Item 5: STANAG wording re plusses – Request from Spain for amendment
See proposed wording at annex 1 to Agenda

- ◆ The Secretary provides more detailed information on the origin of the Spanish request to modify the wording in STANAG 6001, Ed 3 in such a way as to allow Spain to record and/or report results using the plus ratings. JSSG advised the Secretary that such a change to the STANAG 6001, Ed 3 would be administrative and not substantive; therefore it would not need a full ratification with the NSA.
- ◆ CM opens the floor to discussion before the voting. He indicates that the record of decision contains a list of all nations present along with columns indicating agreement, disagreement, abstention or reservations. CM emphasizes that the use of the plus levels will still be optional with the acceptance of the change in wording in Para 6 and 7 to include reporting and recording. The Dutch delegate asks if there might be a risk of having to work with two STANAG versions. The Secretary responds by saying that she would bring this up with the NSA once the change is submitted for approval. The Danish delegate expresses concern that the use of the plus levels might be forced upon nations with the acceptance of this change,

**BUREAU FOR INTERNATIONAL LANGUAGE CO-ORDINATION
BUREAU DE COORDINATION LINGUISTIQUE INTERNATIONALE**

and that this had not been the intention of the STANAG 6001 Edition 3. After some discussion, the amendment was approved with Denmark and Germany abstaining from supporting it. The Czech Republic moves that the amendment be approved, and the motion is seconded by the US. Motion approved with two abstentions.

- ◆ CM introduces Mr. Bruce Bach from the NATO International Staff and Planning Policy Directorate. Mr. Bach acknowledges BILC assistance offered to PfP nations. He mentions that the new Partnership goals have been adjusted to reflect BILC recommendations. CM adjourns the meeting and thanks the SC members for their work and support.

Item 6: BILC Draft Vision/Mission statements.

After discussion, the Mission statement was unanimously approved:

To promote and foster interoperability among NATO and PfP nations by furthering standardization of language training and testing. To support the Alliance's operations through the exchange of knowledge and best practices, IAW established procedures and agreements.

The following Draft Vision statement was unanimously approved:

To achieve levels of excellence where progress made by one is shared by all.

- ◆ The US moves the statements be approved and the motion is seconded by the Czech Republic. Motion approved.

Thursday, May 27, 2010

Study Group Findings/Recommendations:

- ◆ **SG1: CEFR and STANAG.** Findings: There is a perceived need to compare the two systems. At the present time, although some parallels exist between the two systems, they cannot be fully aligned. No concrete recommendations have been put forward except that the situation and the developments in this respect continue to be monitored. Action: Another SG on this topic will be convened in Lithuania.
- ◆ **SG2: BILC National Reports.** The SG recommends that a database be built and populated with specific, relevant information. Action: The Danish delegate will prepare a model that will be circulated, and if satisfactory, used to maintain and update a database of relevant information on course offerings and areas of expertise.
- ◆ **SG3: Testing at level 4:** The SG recommends that an LNA be conducted in order to ascertain how many positions require level 4; that a feasibility study be conducted in order to determine if there is a need for level 4 testing; that a committee be formed to assist countries with level 4 testing, or that a WG develop a level 4 test so that the individual nations do not spend valuable resources in order to test very few people. It is agreed that the LNA identified by SG4 below be conducted first, and that stakeholders be informed of the findings before proceeding. Action: The secretariat will form a WG.

BUREAU FOR INTERNATIONAL LANGUAGE CO-ORDINATION
BUREAU DE COORDINATION LINGUISTIQUE INTERNATIONALE

- ◆ **SG4: Language Needs Analysis of NATO CE/PE Posts:** This group recommends that an analysis be conducted, an LNA team formed, and a job description template designed. Using the results of the analysis, the future WG on level 4 testing would then analyse the need for level 4 testing. It is strongly recommended that this analysis be conducted as soon as possible so that the Secretariat could bring it to JSSG. The Danish delegate observes that not only do nations find it difficult to deliver level 4, but level 3 presents significant challenges as well.
- ◆ The SC approves the conduct of an analysis of a PE unit using VNCs to determine the accuracy of the SLPs. The exact method of conducting this analysis will be determined by team members. Action: WG to convene and conduct analysis.

New Business

- ◆ The Danish delegate also suggests that we need to have clear strategic direction in order to contribute to the effectiveness of operations. The CM states that strategic concepts will appear on the next conference agenda. The IMS delegate points out that BILC has considerable standing in the NATO hierarchy and its ties with JSSG diminish its influence. He endorses the development of a strategic plan. CM states that BILC's ties with JSSG and NTG may be collapsed during the current restructuring of NTG. It would be beneficial for BILC and NATO if it could reorient itself within the context of these changes. Action: Secretariat to explore options.
- ◆ Discussing the E0356 and the lowered 2+ requirement, the German delegate states that it is a problem for those nations who will not use plus levels (as they were optional), and they believed that the plus levels would not appear in the job descriptions. The Secretary mentions that level 3 is difficult to train to and not needed for most positions, and the potential solution is 2+.
- ◆ CM states that the Secretariat would communicate those nations' concern regarding the plus levels that were optional and now seem to be mandatory. The Associate Sec for Training Programs observes that all roads lead to the LNA and only once we have the results will we be able to argue from an informed stance. Action: CM to communicate concerns regarding plus levels to IS.
- ◆ CM canvasses nations to see which ones are interested in taking part in the LNA. The following nations express interest: UK, Germany, Estonia, Canada and Denmark. The analysis would be conducted at SHAPE and PLTCE could provide some financial assistance. See action item regarding SG4 report above.

Item 7: Miscellaneous issues:

Future Conferences and Seminars – Confirmation of Upcoming Hosts

CM requests confirmation of conference and seminar locations and dates.

The 2010 fall seminar in Bulgaria is confirmed, as well as the 2011 conference in Lithuania. The dates for the 2011 conference are to be determined. The seminar in the US is confirmed for October 2011.

***BUREAU FOR INTERNATIONAL LANGUAGE CO-ORDINATION
BUREAU DE COORDINATION LINGUISTIQUE INTERNATIONALE***

The conference in the Czech Republic is confirmed, and the dates are to be determined.
The seminar in Slovenia is also confirmed, dates TBD.
As Croatia is not present, the conference remains unconfirmed.
The seminar in Sweden is confirmed for 2013.

CM asks nations to consult with their authorities and volunteer for the 2014 conference.
Germany confirms the seminar in 2014.

Closing

CM expresses appreciation for the collaboration and dedication of the members of the Steering Committee, and gratitude for the generosity, concern, professionalism, and thoroughness of the hosts.

Julie J. Dubeau, BILC Secretary

Jana Vasilj-Begovic, D/Secretary

June 2010
Rev. Aug 2010.